

CS477 Formal Software Development Methods

Elsa L Gunter
2112 SC, UIUC
egunter@illinois.edu

<http://courses.engr.illinois.edu/cs477>

Slides based in part on previous lectures by Mahesh Vishwanathan, and
by Gul Agha

February 26, 2014

α -equivalence

- $\psi \equiv^{\alpha} \psi$
- If $\psi_1 \equiv^{\alpha} \psi_2$ then $\psi_2 \equiv^{\alpha} \psi_1$.
- If $\psi_1 \equiv^{\alpha} \psi_2$ and $\psi_2 \equiv^{\alpha} \psi_3$ then $\psi_1 \equiv^{\alpha} \psi_3$
- If $x \notin \text{fv}(\psi)$ and $y \notin \text{fv}(\psi)$ then $\psi \equiv^{\alpha} \psi[x \leftrightarrow y]$.
- If $\psi_i \equiv^{\alpha} \psi'_i$ for $i = 1, 2$ then
 - $(\psi_1) \equiv^{\alpha} (\psi'_1) \quad \neg\psi_1 \equiv^{\alpha} \neg\psi'_1$
 - $\psi_1 \otimes \psi_2 \equiv^{\alpha} \psi'_1 \otimes \psi'_2$ for $\otimes \in \{\wedge, \vee, \Rightarrow, \Leftrightarrow\}$
 - $\mathcal{Q}z. \psi_1 \equiv^{\alpha} \mathcal{Q}z. \psi'_1$ for $\mathcal{Q} \in \{\forall, \exists\}$

α -equivalence: Example

$$\begin{aligned} & (x > 3 \wedge (\exists y. (\forall z. z \geq (y - x)) \vee (z \geq y))) \\ \stackrel{\alpha}{\equiv} & (x > 3 \wedge (\exists w. (\forall z. z \geq (w - x)) \vee (z \geq w))) \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & (x > 3 \wedge (\exists y. (\forall z. z \geq (y - x)) \vee (z \geq y))) \\ \stackrel{\alpha}{\equiv} & (x > 3 \wedge (\exists w. (\forall y. y \geq (w - x)) \vee (z \geq w))) \end{aligned}$$

Proof Rules

Will give Sequent version of Natural Deduction rules

All rules from Propositional Logic included

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash \psi'[t/x]}{\Gamma \vdash \exists x.\psi} \text{ Ex I}$$

provided $\psi \stackrel{\alpha}{\equiv} \psi'$

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash \exists x.\psi \quad \Gamma \cup \{(\psi[y/x])\} \vdash \varphi}{\Gamma \vdash \varphi} \text{ Ex E}$$

provided
 $y \notin \text{fv}(\varphi) \cup (\text{fv}(\psi) \setminus \{x\}) \cup \bigcup_{\psi' \in \Gamma} \text{fv}(\psi')$

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash \psi[y/x]}{\Gamma \vdash \forall x.\psi} \text{ All I}$$

provided

$$y \notin (\text{fv}(\psi) \setminus \{x\}) \cup \bigcup_{\psi' \in \Gamma} \text{fv}(\psi')$$

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash \forall x.\psi \quad \Gamma \cup \{\psi'[t/x]\} \vdash \varphi}{\Gamma \vdash \varphi} \text{ All E}$$

provided $\psi \stackrel{\alpha}{\equiv} \psi'$

Example

Show

$$\{ \} \vdash (\exists x. \forall y. x \leq y) \Rightarrow (\forall x. \exists y. y \leq x)$$

Example

Show

$$\frac{\overline{\{(\exists x. \forall y. x \leq y)\} \vdash \forall x. \exists y. y \leq x}}{\{ \} \vdash (\exists x. \forall y. x \leq y) \Rightarrow (\forall x. \exists y. y \leq x)} \text{Imp I}$$

Example

Show

$$\frac{\frac{\{(\exists x. \forall y. x \leq y)\} \vdash \exists y. y \leq x}{\{(\exists x. \forall y. x \leq y)\} \vdash \forall x. \exists y. y \leq x} \text{All I}}{\{\} \vdash (\exists x. \forall y. x \leq y) \Rightarrow (\forall x. \exists y. y \leq x)} \text{Imp I}$$

Example

Show

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{}{\{\exists x. \forall y. x \leq y\} \vdash \exists x. \forall y. x \leq y} \text{Hyp}}{\{\exists x. \forall y. x \leq y\} \vdash \exists y. y \leq x} \text{Ex E}}{\{\exists x. \forall y. x \leq y\} \vdash \exists y. y \leq x} \text{All I}}{\{\exists x. \forall y. x \leq y\} \vdash \forall x. \exists y. y \leq x} \text{Imp I}}{\{\} \vdash (\exists x. \forall y. x \leq y) \Rightarrow (\forall x. \exists y. y \leq x)} \text{Imp I}$$

Example

Show

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\left\{ \begin{array}{l} \exists x. \forall y. x \leq y; \\ \forall y. z \leq y \end{array} \right\} \vdash \forall y. z \leq y}{\exists x. \forall y. x \leq y} \text{ Hyp} \quad \frac{\frac{\left\{ \begin{array}{l} \exists x. \forall y. x \leq y; \\ \forall y. z \leq y; z \leq x \end{array} \right\} \vdash \exists y. y \leq x}{\exists x. \forall y. x \leq y; \forall y. z \leq y} \text{ All E}}{\exists x. \forall y. x \leq y} \text{ Ex E}}{\left\{ \left(\exists x. \forall y. x \leq y \right) \right\} \vdash \exists y. y \leq x} \text{ All I}}{\left\{ \left(\exists x. \forall y. x \leq y \right) \right\} \vdash \forall x. \exists y. y \leq x} \text{ Imp I}}{\{ \} \vdash \left(\exists x. \forall y. x \leq y \right) \Rightarrow \left(\forall x. \exists y. y \leq x \right)} \text{ Imp I}$$

Example

Show

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{}{\{ \exists x. \forall y. x \leq y; \forall y. z \leq y \}}{\vdash \forall y. z \leq y} \text{Hyp}}{\{ \exists x. \forall y. x \leq y \}} \quad \frac{\frac{}{\{ \exists x. \forall y. x \leq y; \forall y. z \leq y; z \leq x \}}{\vdash \exists y. y \leq x} \text{Hyp}}{\{ \exists x. \forall y. x \leq y; \forall y. z \leq y \}} \vdash \exists y. y \leq x \text{All E}}{\{ \exists x. \forall y. x \leq y \} \vdash \exists x. \forall y. x \leq y} \text{Ex E}}{\frac{\{ \exists x. \forall y. x \leq y \} \vdash \exists y. y \leq x \text{All I}}{\{ \exists x. \forall y. x \leq y \} \vdash \forall x. \exists y. y \leq x} \text{All I}}{\{ \} \vdash (\exists x. \forall y. x \leq y) \Rightarrow (\forall x. \exists y. y \leq x) \text{Imp I}} \text{Ex E}$$

Example of Failure

Let's try to show 1

$$\{ \} \vdash (\forall x. \exists y. y \leq x) \Rightarrow (\exists x. \forall y. x \leq y)$$

Example of Failure

Let's try to show 2

$$\frac{\overline{\{\forall x. \exists y. y \leq x\} \vdash \exists x. \forall y. x \leq y}}{\{\} \vdash (\forall x. \exists y. y \leq x) \Rightarrow (\exists x. \forall y. x \leq y)} \text{Imp I}$$

Example of Failure

Let's try to show 3

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{}{\{\forall x. \exists y. y \leq x\} \vdash \forall y. z \leq y}}{\{\forall x. \exists y. y \leq x\} \vdash \exists x. \forall y. x \leq y} \text{Ex I}}{\{\} \vdash (\forall x. \exists y. y \leq x) \Rightarrow (\exists x. \forall y. x \leq y)} \text{Imp I}}$$

Example of Failure

Let's try to show 4

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\{\forall x. \exists y. y \leq x\} \vdash z \leq x}{\{\forall x. \exists y. y \leq x\} \vdash \forall y. z \leq y} \text{All I}}{\{\forall x. \exists y. y \leq x\} \vdash \exists x. \forall y. x \leq y} \text{Ex I}}{\{\} \vdash (\forall x. \exists y. y \leq x) \Rightarrow (\exists x. \forall y. x \leq y)} \text{Imp I}$$

Example of Failure

Let's try to show

5

$$\frac{}{\{\forall x. \exists y. y \leq x\} \vdash \forall x. \exists y. y \leq x}$$

$$\frac{}{\left\{ \begin{array}{l} \forall x. \exists y. y \leq x; \\ \exists y. y \leq x \end{array} \right\} \vdash z \leq x}$$

All E

$$\frac{}{\{\forall x. \exists y. y \leq x\} \vdash z \leq x}$$

All I

$$\frac{}{\{\forall x. \exists y. y \leq x\} \vdash \forall y. z \leq y}$$

Ex I

$$\frac{}{\{\forall x. \exists y. y \leq x\} \vdash \exists x. \forall y. x \leq y}$$

Imp I

$$\frac{}{\{\} \vdash (\forall x. \exists y. y \leq x) \Rightarrow (\exists x. \forall y. x \leq y)}$$

Example of Failure

Let's try to show

7

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\frac{\text{Something}}{\left\{ \begin{array}{l} \text{Lab} \\ \forall x. \exists y. y \leq x; \\ \exists y. y \leq x; z \leq x \end{array} \right\}}{\vdash z \leq x} \text{Ex E}}{\left\{ \begin{array}{l} \forall x. \exists y. y \leq x; \\ \exists y. y \leq x \end{array} \right\}}{\vdash z \leq x} \text{All E}}{\left\{ \forall x. \exists y. y \leq x \right\} \vdash \forall x. \exists y. y \leq x} \text{Hyp}}{\left\{ \forall x. \exists y. y \leq x \right\} \vdash z \leq x} \text{All I}}{\left\{ \forall x. \exists y. y \leq x \right\} \vdash \forall y. z \leq y} \text{Ex I}}{\left\{ \forall x. \exists y. y \leq x \right\} \vdash \exists x. \forall y. x \leq y} \text{Imp I}}{\{ \} \vdash (\forall x. \exists y. y \leq x) \Rightarrow (\exists x. \forall y. x \leq y)} \text{Imp I}$$

Example of Failure

Let's try to show

9

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\frac{\frac{\text{Hyp}}{\{\forall x. \exists y. y \leq x\} \vdash \forall x. \exists y. y \leq x}}{\text{Hyp}} \quad \frac{\frac{\frac{\text{Hyp}}{\{\exists y. y \leq x; z \leq x\} \vdash z \leq x}}{\text{Ex E}} \quad \frac{\text{Hyp}}{\{\forall x. \exists y. y \leq x; \exists y. y \leq x\} \vdash z \leq x}}{\text{Ex E}}}{\text{All E}} \\
 \frac{\frac{\frac{\frac{\frac{\frac{\frac{\frac{\text{Hyp}}{\{\forall x. \exists y. y \leq x\} \vdash z \leq x}}{\text{All I}}}{\{\forall x. \exists y. y \leq x\} \vdash \forall y. z \leq y}}{\text{Ex I}}}{\{\forall x. \exists y. y \leq x\} \vdash \exists x. \forall y. x \leq y}}{\text{Imp I}}}{\{\} \vdash (\forall x. \exists y. y \leq x) \Rightarrow (\exists x. \forall y. x \leq y)}
 \end{array}$$

Floyd-Hoare Logic

- Also called **Axiomatic Semantics**
- Based on formal logic (first order predicate calculus)
- Logical system built from **axioms** and **inference rules**
- Mainly suited to simple imperative programming languages
- Ideas applicable quite broadly

- Used to formally prove a property (**post-condition**) of the **state** (the values of the program variables) after the execution of program, assuming another property (**pre-condition**) of the state holds before execution

Floyd-Hoare Logic

- Goal: Derive statements of form

$$\{P\} C \{Q\}$$

- P , Q logical statements about state, P precondition, Q postcondition, C program
- Example:

$$\{x = 1\} x := x + 1 \{x = 2\}$$

Floyd-Hoare Logic

- **Approach:** For each type of language statement, give an axiom or inference rule stating how to derive assertions of form

$$\{P\} C \{Q\}$$

where C is a statement of that type

- Compose axioms and inference rules to build proofs for complex programs

Partial vs Total Correctness

- An expression $\{P\} C \{Q\}$ is a **partial correctness** statement
- For **total correctness** must also prove that C terminates (i.e. doesn't run forever)
 - Written: $[P] C [Q]$
- Will only consider partial correctness here

Simple Imperative Language

- We will give rules for simple imperative language

$$\begin{aligned} \langle \textit{command} \rangle &::= \langle \textit{variable} \rangle := \langle \textit{term} \rangle \\ &| \langle \textit{command} \rangle; \dots; \langle \textit{command} \rangle \\ &| \textit{if} \langle \textit{statement} \rangle \textit{ then} \langle \textit{command} \rangle \textit{ else} \langle \textit{command} \rangle \\ &| \textit{while} \langle \textit{statement} \rangle \textit{ do} \langle \textit{command} \rangle \end{aligned}$$

- Could add more features, like for-loops

Substitution

- Notation: $P[e/v]$ (sometimes $P[v \rightarrow e]$)
- Meaning: Replace every v in P by e
- Example:

$$(x + 2)[y - 1/x] = ((y - 1) + 2)$$

The Assignment Rule

$$\frac{}{\{P[e/x]\} x := e \{P\}}$$

Example:

$$\frac{}{\{ \quad ? \} x := y \{ x = 2 \}}$$

The Assingment Rule

$$\frac{}{\{P[e/x]\} x := e \{P\}}$$

Example:

$$\frac{}{\{\square = 2\} x := y \{\square = 2\}}$$

The Assignment Rule

$$\frac{}{\{P[e/x]\} x := e \{P\}}$$

Example:

$$\frac{}{\{\boxed{x} = 2\} x := y \{\boxed{x} = 2\}}$$

The Assignment Rule

$$\frac{}{\{P[e/x]\} x := e \{P\}}$$

Examples:

$$\frac{}{\{y = 2\} x := y \{x = 2\}}$$

$$\frac{}{\{y = 2\} x := 2 \{y = x\}}$$

$$\frac{}{\{x + 1 = n + 1\} x := x + 1 \{x = n + 1\}}$$

$$\frac{}{\{2 = 2\} x := 2 \{x = 2\}}$$

The Assignment Rule – Your Turn

- What is the weakest precondition of

$$x := x + y \{ x + y = wx \}?$$

$$\left\{ \begin{array}{c} ? \\ x := x + y \\ \{ x + y = wx \} \end{array} \right\}$$

The Assignment Rule – Your Turn

- What is the weakest precondition of

$$x := x + y \{ x + y = wx \}?$$

$$\{ (x + y) + y = w(x + y) \}$$
$$x := x + y$$
$$\{ x + y = wx \}$$

Precondition Strengthening

$$\frac{(P \Rightarrow P') \{P'\} C \{Q\}}{\{P\} C \{Q\}}$$

- Meaning: If we can show that P implies P' (i.e. $(P \Rightarrow P')$ and we can show that $\{P'\} C \{Q\}$, then we know that $\{P\} C \{Q\}$
- P is **stronger** than P' means $P \Rightarrow P'$

Precondition Strengthening

- Examples:

$$\frac{x = 3 \Rightarrow x < 7 \quad \{x < 7\} x := x + 3 \{x < 10\}}{\{x = 3\} x := x + 3 \{x < 10\}}$$

$$\frac{\text{True} \Rightarrow (2 = 2) \quad \{2 = 2\} x := 2 \{x = 2\}}{\{\text{True}\} x := 2 \{x = 2\}}$$

$$\frac{x = n \Rightarrow x + 1 = n + 1 \quad \{x + 1 = n + 1\} x := x + 1 \{x = n + 1\}}{\{x = n\} x := x + 1 \{x = n + 1\}}$$

Which Inferences Are Correct?

$$\frac{\{x > 0 \wedge x < 5\} x := x * x \{x < 25\}}{\{x = 3\} x := x * x \{x < 25\}}$$

$$\frac{\{x = 3\} x := x * x \{x < 25\}}{\{x > 0 \wedge x < 5\} x := x * x \{x < 25\}}$$

$$\frac{\{x * x < 25\} x := x * x \{x < 25\}}{\{x > 0 \wedge x < 5\} x := x * x \{x < 25\}}$$

Which Inferences Are Correct?

$$\frac{\{x > 0 \wedge x < 5\} x := x * x \{x < 25\}}{\{x = 3\} x := x * x \{x < 25\}} \text{ YES}$$

$$\frac{\{x = 3\} x := x * x \{x < 25\}}{\{x > 0 \wedge x < 5\} x := x * x \{x < 25\}}$$

$$\frac{\{x * x < 25\} x := x * x \{x < 25\}}{\{x > 0 \wedge x < 5\} x := x * x \{x < 25\}}$$

Which Inferences Are Correct?

$$\frac{\{x > 0 \wedge x < 5\} x := x * x \{x < 25\}}{\{x = 3\} x := x * x \{x < 25\}} \text{ YES}$$

$$\frac{\{x = 3\} x := x * x \{x < 25\}}{\{x > 0 \wedge x < 5\} x := x * x \{x < 25\}} \text{ NO}$$

$$\frac{\{x * x < 25\} x := x * x \{x < 25\}}{\{x > 0 \wedge x < 5\} x := x * x \{x < 25\}}$$

Which Inferences Are Correct?

$$\frac{\{x > 0 \wedge x < 5\} x := x * x \{x < 25\}}{\{x = 3\} x := x * x \{x < 25\}} \text{ YES}$$

$$\frac{\{x = 3\} x := x * x \{x < 25\}}{\{x > 0 \wedge x < 5\} x := x * x \{x < 25\}} \text{ NO}$$

$$\frac{\{x * x < 25\} x := x * x \{x < 25\}}{\{x > 0 \wedge x < 5\} x := x * x \{x < 25\}} \text{ YES}$$