

## CS477 Formal Software Development Methods

Elsa L Gunter  
 2112 SC, UIUC  
 egunter@illinois.edu  
<http://courses.engr.illinois.edu/cs477>

Slides based in part on previous lectures by Mahesh Vishwanathan, and by Gul Agha

January 30, 2014

## Proofs in Propositional Logic

- Natural Deduction proofs are
  - trees with nodes that are **inference rules**
  - and a **discharge function**
- Inference rule has **hypotheses** and **conclusion**
- Conclusion: a single proposition
- Hypotheses: zero or more propositions, each possibly with hypotheses
  - Rule with no hypotheses called an **axiom**
- Inference rule graphically presents as

$$\frac{H_1 \dots \overset{A_i}{\vdots} H_i \dots H_j \dots \overset{A_k}{\vdots} H_k \dots H_n}{C} \text{ rule}$$

- Discharge function: maps proof tree leaves with node (induction rule) introducing it
- Instance of inference rule above may **discharge**  $A_i$  and  $A_j$  in a proof using *rule*

## Inference Rules

- Inference rules associated with connectives
- Two main kinds of (non-axiom) inference rules:
  - Introduction** – says how to conclude proposition made from connective is true
    - Proposition below the line is instance of the connective
    - Hypotheses are (some of) connective components
  - Eliminations** – says how to use a proposition made from connective to prove result
- Conclusion: propositional atom (*i.e.* any conclusion can be instance)
- Hypotheses:
  - One that is instance of connective
  - Zero or more with proposition as conclusion, but some connective component as its hypotheses

## Introduction Rules

Truth Introduction:

$$\frac{}{T} \text{ T I}$$

And Introduction:

$$\frac{A \quad B}{A \wedge B} \text{ And I}$$

Or Introduction:

$$\frac{A}{A \vee B} \text{ Or}_L \text{ I}$$

$$\frac{B}{A \vee B} \text{ Or}_R \text{ I}$$

Not Introduction:

$$\frac{A \quad \vdots \quad F}{\neg A} \text{ Not I}$$

Implication Introduction:

$$\frac{A \quad \vdots \quad B}{A \Rightarrow B} \text{ Imp I}$$

No False Introduction

## Example Proof 1

$$\frac{}{A \Rightarrow (B \Rightarrow (A \wedge B))}$$

## Example Proof 1

$$\frac{\frac{A}{B \Rightarrow (A \wedge B)}}{A \Rightarrow (B \Rightarrow (A \wedge B))} \text{ Imp I}$$

### Example Proof 1

$$\frac{\frac{A \quad B}{A \wedge B} \text{ And I}}{B \Rightarrow (A \wedge B)} \text{ Imp I}$$
$$\frac{B \Rightarrow (A \wedge B)}{A \Rightarrow (B \Rightarrow (A \wedge B))} \text{ Imp I}$$

### Example Proof 1

$$\frac{\frac{A \quad B}{A \wedge B} \text{ And I}}{B \Rightarrow (A \wedge B)} \text{ Imp I}$$
$$\frac{B \Rightarrow (A \wedge B)}{A \Rightarrow (B \Rightarrow (A \wedge B))} \text{ Imp I}$$

### Example Proof 1

$$\frac{\frac{A \quad B}{A \wedge B} \text{ And I}}{B \Rightarrow (A \wedge B)} \text{ Imp I}$$
$$\frac{B \Rightarrow (A \wedge B)}{A \Rightarrow (B \Rightarrow (A \wedge B))} \text{ Imp I}$$

- All assumptions discharged; proof complete

### Example Proof 2

$$\frac{}{B \Rightarrow (A \wedge B)}$$

### Example Proof 2

$$\frac{B}{A \wedge B} \text{ And I}$$
$$\frac{A \wedge B}{B \Rightarrow (A \wedge B)} \text{ Imp I}$$

### Example Proof 2

$$\frac{\frac{A \quad B}{A \wedge B} \text{ And I}}{B \Rightarrow (A \wedge B)} \text{ Imp I}$$

## Example Proof 2

$$\frac{\frac{A? \quad B}{A \wedge B} \text{And I}}{B \Rightarrow (A \wedge B)} \text{Imp I}$$

## Example Proof 2

$$\frac{\frac{A \quad B}{A \wedge B} \text{And I}}{B \Rightarrow (A \wedge B)} \text{Imp I}$$

- Closed proofs must discharge all hypotheses
- Otherwise have theorem relative to / under undischarged hypotheses
- Here have proved "Assuming  $A$ , we have  $B \Rightarrow (A \wedge B)$ "

## Discharging Hypothesis

$$\frac{}{A \Rightarrow (A \wedge A)}$$

## Discharging Hypothesis

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{A \quad A}{A \wedge A} \text{And I}}{A \Rightarrow (A \wedge A)} \text{Imp I}}$$

## Discharging Hypothesis

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{A \quad A}{A \wedge A} \text{And I}}{A \Rightarrow (A \wedge A)} \text{Imp I}}$$

- **Imp I** (and other rules discharging assumptions) may discharge multiple instance of hypothesis

## Discharging Hypothesis

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{A \quad A}{A \wedge A} \text{And I}}{A \Rightarrow (A \wedge A)} \text{Imp I}}{A \Rightarrow (B \Rightarrow A)}$$

- **Imp I** (and other rules discharging assumptions) may discharge multiple instance of hypothesis

## Discharging Hypothesis

$$\frac{\frac{A \quad A}{A \wedge A} \text{And I}}{A \Rightarrow (A \wedge A)} \text{Imp I} \qquad \frac{\frac{A}{B \Rightarrow A} \text{Imp I}}{A \Rightarrow (B \Rightarrow A)} \text{Imp I}$$

- Imp I (and other rules discharging assumptions) may discharge multiple instance of hypothesis

## Discharging Hypothesis

$$\frac{\frac{A \quad A}{A \wedge A} \text{And I}}{A \Rightarrow (A \wedge A)} \text{Imp I} \qquad \frac{\frac{A}{B \Rightarrow A} \text{Imp I}}{A \Rightarrow (B \Rightarrow A)} \text{Imp I}$$

- Imp I (and other rules discharging assumptions) may discharge multiple instance of hypothesis

## Discharging Hypothesis

$$\frac{\frac{A \quad A}{A \wedge A} \text{And I}}{A \Rightarrow (A \wedge A)} \text{Imp I} \qquad \frac{\frac{A}{B \Rightarrow A} \text{Imp I}}{A \Rightarrow (B \Rightarrow A)} \text{Imp I}$$

- Imp I (and other rules discharging assumptions) may discharge multiple instance of hypothesis
- Or may discharge none at all
- Every assumption instance discharged only once

## Your Turn

$$\frac{}{A \Rightarrow (A \vee B)}$$

## Elimination Rules

- So far, have rules to "introduce" logical connectives into propositions
- No rules for how to "use" logical connectives
  - No assumptions with logical connectives
- Need "elimination" rules
- Example: Can't prove

$$(A \Rightarrow B) \Rightarrow ((B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C))$$

with what we have so far

- Elimination rules assume assumption with a connective; have general conclusion
  - Generally needs additional hypotheses

## Elimination Rules

False Elimination:

$$\frac{F}{C} \text{F E}$$

Not Elimination:

$$\frac{\neg A \quad A}{C} \text{Not E}$$

And Elimination:

$$\frac{\frac{A \quad B}{A \wedge B} \text{And I} \quad C}{C} \text{And}_L \text{ E}$$

$$\frac{\frac{A \quad B}{A \wedge B} \text{And I} \quad C}{C} \text{And}_R \text{ E}$$

Or Elimination:

$$\frac{\frac{A \quad B}{A \vee B} \text{Or I} \quad C \quad C}{C} \text{Or E}$$

Implication Elimination:

$$\frac{A \Rightarrow B \quad A \quad C}{C} \text{Imp E}$$

### Example Proof 4

$$\frac{}{(A \Rightarrow B) \Rightarrow ((B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C))}$$

### Example Proof 4

$$\frac{\frac{}{(B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C)}}{(A \Rightarrow B) \Rightarrow ((B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C))} \text{ Imp I}$$

### Example Proof 4

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{}{A \Rightarrow C}}{(B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C)} \text{ Imp I}}{(A \Rightarrow B) \Rightarrow ((B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C))} \text{ Imp I}$$

### Example Proof 4

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{C}{A \Rightarrow C} \text{ Imp I}}{(B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C)} \text{ Imp I}}{(A \Rightarrow B) \Rightarrow ((B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C))} \text{ Imp I}$$

### Example Proof 4

$$\frac{A \Rightarrow B \quad A \quad \frac{C}{A \Rightarrow C} \text{ Imp I}}{(B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C)} \text{ Imp E}$$

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{C}{A \Rightarrow C} \text{ Imp I}}{(B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C)} \text{ Imp I}}{(A \Rightarrow B) \Rightarrow ((B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C))} \text{ Imp I}$$

### Example Proof 4

$$\frac{A \Rightarrow B \quad A \quad \frac{C}{A \Rightarrow C} \text{ Imp I}}{(B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C)} \text{ Imp E}$$

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{C}{A \Rightarrow C} \text{ Imp I}}{(B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C)} \text{ Imp I}}{(A \Rightarrow B) \Rightarrow ((B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C))} \text{ Imp I}$$

### Example Proof 4

$$\frac{A \Rightarrow B \quad A \quad \frac{C}{C} \text{ Imp E}}{\frac{C}{A \Rightarrow C} \text{ Imp I}} \text{ Imp E}$$

$$\frac{\frac{C}{A \Rightarrow C} \text{ Imp I}}{(B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C)} \text{ Imp I}$$

$$\frac{(B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C)}{(A \Rightarrow B) \Rightarrow ((B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C))} \text{ Imp I}$$

### Example Proof 4

$$\frac{A \Rightarrow B \quad A \quad \frac{B \Rightarrow C \quad B \quad C}{C} \text{ Imp E}}{\frac{C}{A \Rightarrow C} \text{ Imp I}} \text{ Imp E}$$

$$\frac{\frac{C}{A \Rightarrow C} \text{ Imp I}}{(B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C)} \text{ Imp I}$$

$$\frac{(B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C)}{(A \Rightarrow B) \Rightarrow ((B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C))} \text{ Imp I}$$

### Example Proof 4

$$\frac{A \Rightarrow B \quad A \quad \frac{B \Rightarrow C \quad B \quad C}{C} \text{ Imp E}}{\frac{C}{A \Rightarrow C} \text{ Imp I}} \text{ Imp E}$$

$$\frac{\frac{C}{A \Rightarrow C} \text{ Imp I}}{(B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C)} \text{ Imp I}$$

$$\frac{(B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C)}{(A \Rightarrow B) \Rightarrow ((B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C))} \text{ Imp I}$$

### Example Proof 4

$$\frac{A \Rightarrow B \quad A \quad \frac{B \Rightarrow C \quad B \quad C}{C} \text{ Imp E}}{\frac{C}{A \Rightarrow C} \text{ Imp I}} \text{ Imp E}$$

$$\frac{\frac{C}{A \Rightarrow C} \text{ Imp I}}{(B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C)} \text{ Imp I}$$

$$\frac{(B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C)}{(A \Rightarrow B) \Rightarrow ((B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C))} \text{ Imp I}$$

### Example Proof 4

$$\frac{A \Rightarrow B \quad A \quad \frac{B \Rightarrow C \quad B \quad C}{C} \text{ Imp E}}{\frac{C}{A \Rightarrow C} \text{ Imp I}} \text{ Imp E}$$

$$\frac{\frac{C}{A \Rightarrow C} \text{ Imp I}}{(B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C)} \text{ Imp I}$$

$$\frac{(B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C)}{(A \Rightarrow B) \Rightarrow ((B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C))} \text{ Imp I}$$

### Some Well-Known Derived Rules

Modus Ponens

$$\frac{A \Rightarrow B \quad A}{B} \text{ MP}$$

$$\frac{A \Rightarrow B \quad A \quad B}{B} \text{ Imp E}$$

Left Conjunct

$$\frac{A \wedge B}{A} \text{ AndL}$$

$$\frac{A \wedge B \quad A}{A} \text{ And}_L \text{ E}$$

Right Conjunct

$$\frac{A \wedge B}{B} \text{ AndR}$$

$$\frac{A \wedge B \quad A}{A} \text{ And}_R \text{ E}$$

## Your Turn

$$\frac{}{(A \wedge B) \Rightarrow (A \vee B)}$$

## Assumptions in Natural Deduction

- Problem: Keeping track of hypotheses and their discharge in Natural Deduction is *HARD!*
- Solution: Use *sequents* to track hypotheses
- A **sequent** is a pair of
  - A set of propositions (called assumptions, or hypotheses of sequent) and
  - A proposition (called conclusion of sequent)
- More generally (not here), allow set of hypotheses and set of conclusions

## Nat. Ded. Introduction Sequent Rules

$\Gamma$  is set of propositions (assumptions/hypotheses)  
Hypothesis Introduction:

$$\frac{}{\Gamma \cup \{A\} \vdash A} \text{Hyp}$$

Truth Introduction:

$$\frac{}{\Gamma \vdash \mathbf{T}} \text{T I}$$

And Introduction:

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash A \quad \Gamma \vdash B}{\Gamma \vdash A \wedge B} \text{And I}$$

Or Introduction:

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash A}{\Gamma \vdash A \vee B} \text{Or}_L \text{ I}$$

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash B}{\Gamma \vdash A \vee B} \text{Or}_R \text{ I}$$

Not Introduction:

$$\frac{\Gamma \cup \{A\} \vdash \mathbf{F}}{\Gamma \vdash \neg A} \text{Not I}$$

Implication Introduction:

$$\frac{\Gamma \cup \{A\} \vdash B}{\Gamma \vdash A \Rightarrow B} \text{Imp I}$$

## Nat. Ded. Elimination Sequent Rules

$\Gamma$  is set of propositions (assumptions/hypotheses)

Not Elimination:

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash \neg A \quad \Gamma \vdash A}{\Gamma \vdash \mathbf{C}} \text{Not E}$$

Implication Elimination:

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash A \Rightarrow B \quad \Gamma \vdash A \quad \Gamma \cup \{B\} \vdash C}{\Gamma \vdash C} \text{Imp E}$$

And Elimination:

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash A \wedge B \quad \Gamma \cup \{A\} \vdash C}{\Gamma \vdash C} \text{And}_L \text{ E}$$

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash A \wedge B \quad \Gamma \cup \{B\} \vdash C}{\Gamma \vdash C} \text{And}_R \text{ E}$$

False Elimination:

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash \mathbf{F}}{\Gamma \vdash \mathbf{C}} \text{F E}$$

Or Elimination:

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash A \vee B \quad \Gamma \cup \{A\} \vdash C \quad \Gamma \cup \{B\} \vdash C}{\Gamma \vdash C} \text{Or E}$$

## Example Proof 4, Revised

$$\frac{}{\{\} \vdash (A \Rightarrow B) \Rightarrow ((B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C))}$$

## Example Proof 4, Revised

$$\frac{\{A \Rightarrow B\} \vdash (B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C)}{\{\} \vdash (A \Rightarrow B) \Rightarrow ((B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C))} \text{Imp I}$$





### Example Proof 4, Revised

$\Gamma_3 = \{A \Rightarrow B, B \Rightarrow C, A\}$   
 $\Gamma_4 = \{A \Rightarrow B, B \Rightarrow C, A, B\}$   
 $\Gamma_5 = \{A \Rightarrow B, B \Rightarrow C, A, B, C\}$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\text{Hyp}}{\Gamma_3 \vdash A \Rightarrow B} \quad \frac{\text{Hyp}}{\Gamma_3 \vdash A} \quad \frac{\text{Hyp}}{\Gamma_4 \vdash B \Rightarrow C} \quad \frac{\text{Hyp}}{\Gamma_4 \vdash B} \quad \frac{\text{Hyp}}{\Gamma_5 \vdash C} \\
 \hline
 \Gamma_4 \vdash C \quad \text{Imp E} \\
 \hline
 \Gamma_3 \vdash A \Rightarrow B \quad \Gamma_3 \vdash A \quad \Gamma_4 \vdash C \quad \text{Imp E} \\
 \hline
 \{A \Rightarrow B, B \Rightarrow C, A\} \vdash C \quad \text{Imp I} \\
 \{A \Rightarrow B, B \Rightarrow C\} \vdash A \Rightarrow C \quad \text{Imp I} \\
 \{A \Rightarrow B\} \vdash (B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C) \quad \text{Imp I} \\
 \{\} \vdash (A \Rightarrow B) \Rightarrow ((B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C)) \quad \text{Imp I}
 \end{array}$$

### Example Proof 4, Revised

$\Gamma_3 = \{A \Rightarrow B, B \Rightarrow C, A\}$   
 $\Gamma_4 = \{A \Rightarrow B, B \Rightarrow C, A, B\}$   
 $\Gamma_5 = \{A \Rightarrow B, B \Rightarrow C, A, B, C\}$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\text{Hyp}}{\Gamma_3 \vdash A \Rightarrow B} \quad \frac{\text{Hyp}}{\Gamma_3 \vdash A} \quad \frac{\text{Hyp}}{\Gamma_4 \vdash B \Rightarrow C} \quad \frac{\text{Hyp}}{\Gamma_4 \vdash B} \quad \frac{\text{Hyp}}{\Gamma_5 \vdash C} \\
 \hline
 \Gamma_4 \vdash C \quad \text{Imp E} \\
 \hline
 \Gamma_3 \vdash A \Rightarrow B \quad \Gamma_3 \vdash A \quad \Gamma_4 \vdash C \quad \text{Imp E} \\
 \hline
 \{A \Rightarrow B, B \Rightarrow C, A\} \vdash C \quad \text{Imp I} \\
 \{A \Rightarrow B, B \Rightarrow C\} \vdash A \Rightarrow C \quad \text{Imp I} \\
 \{A \Rightarrow B\} \vdash (B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C) \quad \text{Imp I} \\
 \{\} \vdash (A \Rightarrow B) \Rightarrow ((B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C)) \quad \text{Imp I}
 \end{array}$$

### Example Proof 4, Revised

$\Gamma_3 = \{A \Rightarrow B, B \Rightarrow C, A\}$   
 $\Gamma_4 = \{A \Rightarrow B, B \Rightarrow C, A, B\}$   
 $\Gamma_5 = \{A \Rightarrow B, B \Rightarrow C, A, B, C\}$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\text{Hyp}}{\Gamma_3 \vdash A \Rightarrow B} \quad \frac{\text{Hyp}}{\Gamma_3 \vdash A} \quad \frac{\text{Hyp}}{\Gamma_4 \vdash B \Rightarrow C} \quad \frac{\text{Hyp}}{\Gamma_4 \vdash B} \quad \frac{\text{Hyp}}{\Gamma_5 \vdash C} \\
 \hline
 \Gamma_4 \vdash C \quad \text{Imp E} \\
 \hline
 \Gamma_3 \vdash A \Rightarrow B \quad \Gamma_3 \vdash A \quad \Gamma_4 \vdash C \quad \text{Imp E} \\
 \hline
 \{A \Rightarrow B, B \Rightarrow C, A\} \vdash C \quad \text{Imp I} \\
 \{A \Rightarrow B, B \Rightarrow C\} \vdash A \Rightarrow C \quad \text{Imp I} \\
 \{A \Rightarrow B\} \vdash (B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C) \quad \text{Imp I} \\
 \{\} \vdash (A \Rightarrow B) \Rightarrow ((B \Rightarrow C) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow C)) \quad \text{Imp I}
 \end{array}$$