Algorithms \& Models of Computation

## CS/ECE 374, Fall 2020

19.6.3

Proving optimality of earliest finish time

## Earliest finish time: A quick recall



Time

## Earliest finish time: A quick recall



## Earliest finish time: A quick recall



Time

## Earliest finish time: A quick recall



## Earliest finish time: A quick recall



## Earliest finish time: A quick recall



## Earliest finish time: A quick recall



Earliest finish time: A quick recall


Earliest finish time: A quick recall


Earliest finish time: A quick recall


Earliest finish time: A quick recall


Time

Earliest finish time: A quick recall


Earliest finish time: A quick recall


Earliest finish time: A quick recall


Earliest finish time: A quick recall


Earliest finish time: A quick recall


Earliest finish time: A quick recall


Earliest finish time: A quick recall


## Earliest finish time: A quick recall



## Earliest finish time: A quick recall



## Earliest finish time: A quick recall



## Proving Optimality

(1) Correctness: Clearly the algorithm returns a set of jobs that does not have any conflicts
(2) For a set of requests $R$, let $O$ be an optimal set and let $X$ be the set returned by the greedy algorithm. Then $O=X$ ?

## Proving Optimality

(1) Correctness: Clearly the algorithm returns a set of jobs that does not have any conflicts
(2) For a set of requests $R$, let $O$ be an optimal set and let $X$ be the set returned by the greedy algorithm. Then $\boldsymbol{O}=\boldsymbol{X}$ ?

Instead we will show that $|O|=|X|$

## Proving Optimality

(1) Correctness: Clearly the algorithm returns a set of jobs that does not have any conflicts
(2) For a set of requests $\boldsymbol{R}$, let $\boldsymbol{O}$ be an optimal set and let $\boldsymbol{X}$ be the set returned by the greedy algorithm. Then $O=X$ ? Not likely!


Instead we will show that $|O|=|X|$

## Proving Optimality

(1) Correctness: Clearly the algorithm returns a set of jobs that does not have any conflicts
(2) For a set of requests $\boldsymbol{R}$, let $\boldsymbol{O}$ be an optimal set and let $\boldsymbol{X}$ be the set returned by the greedy algorithm. Then $O=X$ ? Not likely!


Instead we will show that $|O|=|X|$

## Proving Optimality

(1) Correctness: Clearly the algorithm returns a set of jobs that does not have any conflicts
(2) For a set of requests $\boldsymbol{R}$, let $\boldsymbol{O}$ be an optimal set and let $\boldsymbol{X}$ be the set returned by the greedy algorithm. Then $O=X$ ? Not likely!


Instead we will show that $|O|=|X|$

## Proving Optimality

(1) Correctness: Clearly the algorithm returns a set of jobs that does not have any conflicts
(2) For a set of requests $\boldsymbol{R}$, let $\boldsymbol{O}$ be an optimal set and let $\boldsymbol{X}$ be the set returned by the greedy algorithm. Then $O=X$ ? Not likely!


Instead we will show that $|O|=|X|$

## Helper Claim

## Claim 19.3.

i be first interval picked by Greedy into solution.
O: Optimal solution.
If $i \notin O$, there is exactly one interval $j_{1} \in O$ that conflicts with $i$.

## Proof.

(1) No $j \in O$ conflicts $i \Longrightarrow O$ is not opt!
(2) Suppose $j_{1}, j_{2} \in O$ such that $j_{1} \neq j_{2}$ and both $j_{1}$ and $j_{2}$ conflict with $i$.

- Since $\boldsymbol{i}$ has earliest finish time, $\boldsymbol{j}_{1}$ and $\boldsymbol{i}$ overlap at $\boldsymbol{f}(\boldsymbol{i})$.
(0) For same reason $\boldsymbol{j}_{2}$ also overlaps with $\boldsymbol{i}$ at $f(i)$.
- Implies that $\boldsymbol{j}_{1}, \boldsymbol{j}_{2}$ overlap at $\boldsymbol{f}(\boldsymbol{i})$ but intervals in $O$ cannot overlap.



## Proof of Optimality: Key Lemma

Lemma 19.4.
$\boldsymbol{i}_{1}$ be first interval picked by Greedy. There exists an optimum solution that contains $\boldsymbol{i}_{1}$.
Proof.
Let $O$ be an arbitrary optimum solution. If $i_{1} \in O$ we are done.
(1) Exists exactly one $j_{1} \in O$ conflicting with $i_{1}$
(2) Form a new set $O^{\prime}$ by removing $\boldsymbol{i}_{1}$ from $O$ and adding $i_{1}$, that is
(3) From claim, $O^{\prime}$ is a feasible solution (no conflicts)
( Since $\left|O^{\prime}\right|=|O|, O^{\prime}$ is also an optimum solution and it contains $i_{1}$.

## Proof of Optimality: Key Lemma

Lemma 19.4.
$i_{1}$ be first interval picked by Greedy. There exists an optimum solution that contains $\boldsymbol{i}_{1}$.
Proof.
Let $O$ be an arbitrary optimum solution. If $i_{1} \in O$ we are done. By Claim 19.3 ...
(1) Exists exactly one $\boldsymbol{j}_{1} \in O$ conflicting with $\boldsymbol{i}_{1}$.
(3) Form a new set $O^{\prime}$ by removing $j_{1}$ from $O$ and adding $i_{1}$, that is

- From claim, $O^{\prime}$ is a feasible solution (no conflicts)
- Since $\left|O^{\prime}\right|=|O|, O^{\prime}$ is also an optimum solution anc it contains $i_{1}$


## Proof of Optimality: Key Lemma

## Lemma 19.4.

$\boldsymbol{i}_{1}$ be first interval picked by Greedy. There exists an optimum solution that contains $\boldsymbol{i}_{1}$.

## Proof.

Let $O$ be an arbitrary optimum solution. If $i_{1} \in O$ we are done. By Claim 19.3 ...
(1) Exists exactly one $j_{1} \in O$ conflicting with $i_{1}$.
(2) Form a new set $O^{\prime}$ by removing $j_{1}$ from $O$ and adding $i_{1}$, that is $O^{\prime}=\left(O-\left\{j_{1}\right\}\right) \cup\left\{i_{1}\right\}$.
(3) From claim, $O^{\prime}$ is a feasible solution (no conflicts).
(9) Since $\left|O^{\prime}\right|=|O|, O^{\prime}$ is also an optimum solution and it contains $i_{1}$.

## Proof of Optimality of Earliest Finish Time First

Proof by Induction on number of intervals.
Base Case: $\boldsymbol{n}=1$. Trivial since Greedy picks one interval.

```
Induction Step: Assume theorem holds for i < n
Let }
i}\mp@subsup{i}{1}{}\Leftarrow\mathrm{ First interval picked by greedy algorithm
K'}\Leftarrow\mathrm{ The result of removing i}\mp@subsup{i}{1}{}\mathrm{ and all conflicting intervals from K.
|'}\mp@subsup{K}{}{\prime}=|K|-1
G(K),G(\mp@subsup{K}{}{\prime}): Solution produced by Greedy on }K\mathrm{ and }\mp@subsup{K}{}{\prime}\mathrm{ ', respectively.
Lemma 19.4\Longrightarrow optimum solution O to K with i}\mp@subsup{i}{1}{}\inO\mathrm{ .
Let O
```



## Proof of Optimality of Earliest Finish Time First

Proof by Induction on number of intervals.
Base Case: $\boldsymbol{n}=1$. Trivial since Greedy picks one interval. Induction Step: Assume theorem holds for $\boldsymbol{i}<\boldsymbol{n}$. Let $K$ be an input (i.e., instance) with $n$ intervals


## Proof of Optimality of Earliest Finish Time First

Proof by Induction on number of intervals.
Base Case: $\boldsymbol{n}=1$. Trivial since Greedy picks one interval. Induction Step: Assume theorem holds for $\boldsymbol{i}<\boldsymbol{n}$.
Let $K$ be an input (i.e., instance) with $n$ intervals $i_{1} \Leftarrow$ First interval picked by greedy algorithm.


## Proof of Optimality of Earliest Finish Time First

Proof by Induction on number of intervals.
Base Case: $\boldsymbol{n}=1$. Trivial since Greedy picks one interval. Induction Step: Assume theorem holds for $\boldsymbol{i}<\boldsymbol{n}$.
Let $K$ be an input (i.e., instance) with $n$ intervals
$i_{1} \Leftarrow$ First interval picked by greedy algorithm.
$K^{\prime} \Leftarrow$ The result of removing $i_{1}$ and all conflicting intervals from $K$.


## Proof of Optimality of Earliest Finish Time First

Proof by Induction on number of intervals.
Base Case: $\boldsymbol{n}=1$. Trivial since Greedy picks one interval. Induction Step: Assume theorem holds for $\boldsymbol{i}<\boldsymbol{n}$.
Let $K$ be an input (i.e., instance) with $\boldsymbol{n}$ intervals
$i_{1} \Leftarrow$ First interval picked by greedy algorithm.
$K^{\prime} \Leftarrow$ The result of removing $i_{1}$ and all conflicting intervals from $K$.
$\left|K^{\prime}\right|=|K|-1$.
Solution produced by Greedy on $K$ and $K^{\prime}$, respectively.

from Greedy description

## Proof of Optimality of Earliest Finish Time First

## Proof by Induction on number of intervals.

Base Case: $\boldsymbol{n}=1$. Trivial since Greedy picks one interval. Induction Step: Assume theorem holds for $\boldsymbol{i}<\boldsymbol{n}$.
Let $K$ be an input (i.e., instance) with $\boldsymbol{n}$ intervals
$i_{1} \Leftarrow$ First interval picked by greedy algorithm.
$K^{\prime} \Leftarrow$ The result of removing $i_{1}$ and all conflicting intervals from $K$.
$\left|K^{\prime}\right|=|K|-1$.
$G(K), G\left(K^{\prime}\right)$ : Solution produced by Greedy on $K$ and $K^{\prime}$, respectively.


## Proof of Optimality of Earliest Finish Time First

## Proof by Induction on number of intervals.

Base Case: $\boldsymbol{n}=1$. Trivial since Greedy picks one interval. Induction Step: Assume theorem holds for $\boldsymbol{i}<\boldsymbol{n}$.
Let $K$ be an input (i.e., instance) with $\boldsymbol{n}$ intervals
$i_{1} \Leftarrow$ First interval picked by greedy algorithm.
$K^{\prime} \Leftarrow$ The result of removing $i_{1}$ and all conflicting intervals from $K$.
$\left|K^{\prime}\right|=|K|-1$.
$G(K), G\left(K^{\prime}\right)$ : Solution produced by Greedy on $K$ and $K^{\prime}$, respectively.
Lemma $19.4 \Longrightarrow$ optimum solution $O$ to $K$ with $i_{1} \in O$.


## Proof of Optimality of Earliest Finish Time First

## Proof by Induction on number of intervals.

Base Case: $\boldsymbol{n}=1$. Trivial since Greedy picks one interval. Induction Step: Assume theorem holds for $\boldsymbol{i}<\boldsymbol{n}$.
Let $K$ be an input (i.e., instance) with $n$ intervals
$i_{1} \Leftarrow$ First interval picked by greedy algorithm.
$K^{\prime} \Leftarrow$ The result of removing $i_{1}$ and all conflicting intervals from $K$.
$\left|K^{\prime}\right|=|K|-1$.
$G(K), G\left(K^{\prime}\right)$ : Solution produced by Greedy on $K$ and $K^{\prime}$, respectively.
Lemma $19.4 \Longrightarrow$ optimum solution $O$ to $K$ with $i_{1} \in O$.
Let $O^{\prime}=O-\left\{i_{1}\right\} . O^{\prime}$ is a solution to $K^{\prime}$.

$$
|G(K)|=1+\left|G\left(K^{\prime}\right)\right| \quad \text { from Greedy description }
$$

## Proof of Optimality of Earliest Finish Time First

## Proof by Induction on number of intervals.

Base Case: $\boldsymbol{n}=1$. Trivial since Greedy picks one interval.
Induction Step: Assume theorem holds for $\boldsymbol{i}<\boldsymbol{n}$.
Let $K$ be an input (i.e., instance) with $n$ intervals
$i_{1} \Leftarrow$ First interval picked by greedy algorithm.
$K^{\prime} \Leftarrow$ The result of removing $i_{1}$ and all conflicting intervals from $K$.
$\left|K^{\prime}\right|=|K|-1$.
$G(K), G\left(K^{\prime}\right)$ : Solution produced by Greedy on $K$ and $K^{\prime}$, respectively.
Lemma $19.4 \Longrightarrow$ optimum solution $O$ to $K$ with $i_{1} \in O$.
Let $O^{\prime}=O-\left\{i_{1}\right\} . O^{\prime}$ is a solution to $K^{\prime}$.

$$
\begin{array}{rlr}
|G(K)| & =1+\left|G\left(K^{\prime}\right)\right| \quad \text { from Greedy description } \\
& \left.\geq 1+\left|O^{\prime}\right| \quad \text { By induction, } G\left(I^{\prime}\right) \text { is optimum for } I^{\prime}\right)
\end{array}
$$

## Proof of Optimality of Earliest Finish Time First

## Proof by Induction on number of intervals.

Base Case: $\boldsymbol{n}=1$. Trivial since Greedy picks one interval. Induction Step: Assume theorem holds for $\boldsymbol{i}<\boldsymbol{n}$.
Let $K$ be an input (i.e., instance) with $n$ intervals
$i_{1} \Leftarrow$ First interval picked by greedy algorithm.
$K^{\prime} \Leftarrow$ The result of removing $i_{1}$ and all conflicting intervals from $K$.
$\left|K^{\prime}\right|=|K|-1$.
$G(K), G\left(K^{\prime}\right)$ : Solution produced by Greedy on $K$ and $K^{\prime}$, respectively.
Lemma $19.4 \Longrightarrow$ optimum solution $O$ to $K$ with $i_{1} \in O$.
Let $O^{\prime}=O-\left\{i_{1}\right\} . O^{\prime}$ is a solution to $K^{\prime}$.

$$
\begin{array}{rlr}
|G(K)| & =1+\left|G\left(K^{\prime}\right)\right| \quad \text { from Greedy description } \\
& \left.\geq 1+\left|O^{\prime}\right| \quad \text { By induction, } G\left(I^{\prime}\right) \text { is optimum for } I^{\prime}\right) \\
& =|O|
\end{array}
$$

## THE END

(for now)

